

Disability and *Ubuntu*

An African approach to inclusive education

Dr Femke Bannink Mbazzi
MRC/UVRI & LSHTM Uganda Research Unit

Contents

- Editorial..... 3
- Bibliography..... 4
- Summary..... 7
- Literature review 8
 - The concept of ‘Ubuntu’ 8
 - Disability definitions in sub-Saharan Africa..... 8
 - Ubuntu and disability 9
 - Ubuntu and inclusive education 10
 - Practical implications of Ubuntu inspired inclusive education 11
 - An attitude of hospitality and belonging 11
 - Shared responsibility: family and community involvement..... 12
 - Supportive Ubuntu inspired practices in the classroom 13
 - Teaching Ubuntu 14
 - Participation in policy reform 14
 - Curriculum reform..... 15
 - Conclusion 16
- Key points 16
- Reading notes 17

Editorial

The goal of this literary review is to provide information on the African Ubuntu concept in relation to inclusive education, providing readers with access to an initial list of documents submitted in an annotated bibliography and reading notes.

This work does not intent to be comprehensive but aims to identify the importance of cultural concepts of disability and inclusive education to counter and decolonize the dominant disability discourse on inclusive education imported from high income countries. This research could inform field stakeholders to decolonize disability programs and build on existing family and community resources in Africa to improve inclusive education for children, youth, and adults with disabilities.

Key words search Google and Google Scholar: ubuntu, inclusive, education, disability, Africa.

Time period: January 2010 – March 2022

Full original list found: 41, screened 4 irrelevant, 37 reviewed, 3 excluded based on eligibility criteria: text discusses ubuntu, disability and education in (an) Africa(n) country.

Bibliography

Open Access research papers:

1. Bannink Mbazzi, F., Nalugya, R., Kawesa, E., Nambejja, H., Nizeyimana, P., Ojok, P., ... & Seeley, J. (2020). 'Ubuntu Bulamu'—Development and Testing of an Indigenous Intervention for Disability Inclusion in Uganda. *Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research*, 22(1), 403-416. <https://www.sjdr.se/articles/10.16993/sjdr.697/>
2. Berghs, M. (2017). Practices and discourses of ubuntu: Implications for an African model of disability?. *African Journal of Disability*, 6(1), 1-8. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5502472/pdf/AJOD-6-292.pdf>
3. Biraimah, K. L. (2016). Moving beyond a destructive past to a decolonised and inclusive future: The role of ubuntu-style education in providing culturally relevant pedagogy for Namibia. *International Review of Education*, 62(1), 45-62. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11159-016-9541-1>.
4. Chiwandire. 2021. "Munhu wese ihama yako (everyone is your relative)": Ubuntu and the social inclusion of students with disabilities at South African universities. Master thesis 484 pages. Rhodes University. <http://hdl.handle.net/10962/170578>
5. Chiwaya, S., Dreyer, L., & Damons, L. (2020) Ubuntu in inclusive education: a malawian experience. *inclusivity in response to diversity and equal human rights*. Abstract conference paper. Page 130 – 132. <http://hdl.handle.net/10962/170578>
6. Collins-Warfield, A. E. (2008). "Ubuntu"—Philosophy and Practice: An Examination of Xhosa Teachers' Psychological Sense of Community in Langa, South Africa (Doctoral dissertation, Bowling Green State University). https://etd.ohiolink.edu/apexprod/rws_olink/r/1501/10?clear=10&p10_accession_num=bgsu1225405676
7. Ejuu, G., & Opiyo, R. A. Nurturing Ubuntu, the African Form of Human Flourishing through Inclusive Home Based Early Childhood Education. In *Frontiers in Education*. <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.838770/full>
8. Howell, C., Lorenzo, T., & Sompeta-Gcaza, S. (2019). Reimagining personal and collective experiences of disability in Africa. *Disability and the Global South*, 6(2), 1719-1735. https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10077477/1/06_02_02.pdf
9. Lephoto, M. N. R. (2021). Application of Ubuntu Philosophy for the enhancement of Guidance and Counselling: An alternative for facilitating Inclusive Education in Lesotho. *African Perspectives of Research in Teaching and Learning*, 5, 95-107. https://www.ul.ac.za/aportal/application/downloads/Article_5_12_2021.pdf
10. Lorenzo, T., 2003. No African renaissance without disabled women: a communal approach to human development in Cape Town South Africa. *Disability & Society*, 18 (6), 759–778. https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/0968759032000119505?casa_token=EXYmAbI2euUAAAAA:c5AVeudqibNkiOXI5dvcYbC76KkFU5Oge8l0qMp6s43NqO5OJBQwvdxHXLVvKi2240Ce5lOrU5ntp
11. Masondo, C. N. (2017). *Enhancing the effectiveness of principals in implementing inclusive education using Ubuntu approach* (Doctoral dissertation, University of the Free State). <https://scholar.ufs.ac.za/bitstream/handle/11660/7653/MasondoNC.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>

12. Mji, G., Gcaza, S., Swartz, L., MacLachlan, M., & Hutton, B. (2011). An African way of networking around disability. *Disability & Society*, 26(3), 365-368.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09687599.2011.560419>
13. Mugumbate, J. (2020). Baba Jairos Jiri's ubuntu models of charity, disability and rehabilitation. *African Journal of Social Work*, 10(1), 83-88.
<https://www.ajol.info/index.php/ajsw/article/view/194112>
14. Mutanga, O. (2022). Perceptions and experiences of teachers in Zimbabwe on inclusive education and teacher training: the value of Unhu/Ubuntu philosophy. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 1-20.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2022.2048102>
15. Muzata, K. K., Mahlo, D., & Simui, F. (2021). The Extended Family System as a Model of Africanizing Inclusive Education Through Ubuntu. In *Understanding Ubuntu for Enhancing Intercultural Communications* (pp. 13-27). IGI Global. <https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/the-extended-family-system-as-a-model-of-africanizing-inclusive-education-through-ubuntu/276719>
16. Mahaye, N. E. (2018, January 18). The philosophy of ubuntu in education. Unpublished work.
17. Odari, M. H. (2020). The role of value creating education and Ubuntu philosophy in fostering humanism in Kenya. *Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies in Education*, 9, 56, 68.
<https://www.ojed.org/index.php/jise/article/view/1857>
18. Ohajunwa, Chioma O. "Local knowledge in inclusive education policies in Africa: informing sustainable outcomes." *African journal of disability* vol. 11 941. 31 Jan. 2022, doi:10.4102/ajod.v11i0.941. <https://ajod.org/index.php/ajod/article/view/941/1705>
19. Oviawe, J. O. (2016). How to rediscover the ubuntu paradigm in education. *International Review of Education*, 62, 1-10. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11159-016-9545-x>
20. Pather, S. (2019). Confronting inclusive education in Africa since Salamanca. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 23(7-8), 782-795.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2019.1623329>
21. Shanyanana, R. N., & Waghid, Y. (2016). Reconceptualizing ubuntu as inclusion in African higher education: Towards equalization of voice.
<https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/188225091.pdf>
22. Walton, E. (2018). Decolonising (through) inclusive education? *Educational research for social change*, 7(SPE), 31-45. <http://www.scielo.org.za/pdf/ersc/v7nspe/04.pdf>

Not Open Access research papers:

23. Bannink, F., Nalugya, R., & van Hove, G. (2020). 'They Give Him a Chance'-Parents' Perspectives on Disability and Inclusive Primary Education in Uganda. *International Journal of Disability, Development and Education*, 67(4), 357-375.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/1034912X.2019.1593326>
24. Chataika, T., & McKenzie, J. (2013). Considerations of an African childhood disability studies. In *Disabled children's childhood studies* (pp. 152-163). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137008220_12
25. Chataika, T., & McKenzie, J. A. (2016). Global institutions and their engagement with disability mainstreaming in the south: Development and (dis) connections. In *Disability in the Global*

- South (pp. 423-436). Springer, Cham. <https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/978-3-319-42488-0>
26. Gwaravanda, E. T. (2021). Ubuntu and African Disability Education: An Ethical Perspective From the Global South. In *Social, Educational, and Cultural Perspectives of Disabilities in the Global South* (pp. 1-14). IGI Global. <https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/ubuntu-and-african-disability-education/268102>
 27. Maguvhe, M. O., & Masuku, M. M. (Eds.). (2021). *Handbook of Research on Creating Spaces for African Epistemologies in the Inclusive Education Discourse*. IGI Global. <https://www.igi-global.com/book/handbook-research-creating-spaces-african/290029>
 28. Makalela, L. (2018). Community elders' narrative accounts of ubuntu translanguaging: Learning and teaching in African education. *International Review of Education*, 64(6), 823-843. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/44980164>
 29. Musengi, M. (2021). Ubuntu for Disability-Inclusive Pedagogy: Illustrations From Deaf Education in Zimbabwe. In *Understanding Ubuntu for Enhancing Intercultural Communications* (pp. 189-201). IGI Global. <https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/ubuntu-for-disability-inclusive-pedagogy/276732>
 30. Ned, L. Y. (2022). African Renaissance as a Premise for Reimagined Disability Studies in Africa. *Journal of Black Studies*, 00219347221074391. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/00219347221074391>
 31. Nel, M. (2020). Inclusive and Special Education in Africa. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Education*. <https://oxfordre.com/education/view/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.001.0001/acrefore-9780190264093-e-1008>

Grey literature:

32. Chinhanu, Chiedza, and Adebayo, Seun B. (2020) Ubuntu in Education: Towards equitable teaching and learning for all in the era of SDG 4. <https://www.norrag.org/ubuntu-in-education-towards-equitable-teaching-and-learning-for-all-in-the-era-of-sdg-4-by-chiedza-a-chinhanu-and-seun-b-adebayo/>
33. Comparative and International Education Society (2015) "Ubuntu! Imagining a humanist education globally" . 59th annual conference of the Comparative and International Education Society (CIES). Washington DC. March 8–13 March 2015. <https://en.unesco.org/news/ubuntu-education-special-issue-ire-explores-philosophy-connectedness#:~:text=Ubuntu%20is%20a%20philosophy%20based,is%20interdependent%20and%20mutually%20beneficial>
34. Global Disability Summit (2018) Inclusive Education in Africa and Global Disability Summit 2018. <https://www.globaldisabilitysummit.org/blogs/inclusive-education-in-africa-and-global-disability-summit-2018> Mention of Ubuntu only to say that it related to SDGs and all deserve health access as by Ubuntu philosophy, nothing else.
35. Miles, M & C. Miles (2018) Disability in Africa : religious, ethical and healing responses, to and by People with Disabilities, Deafness, or Mental Debility: a bibliography through four millennia, with introduction and partial annotation. <https://www.independentliving.org/docs7/mmiles-disability-africa-bibliography-2018.html>
36. Stellenbosch University (2022) Teaching for Change: An African Philosophical Approach. Understand teaching and learning in an African context and learn about cultivating

pedagogical encounters in relation to Africa. <https://www.futurelearn.com/courses/african-philosophy>

37. Wahgid, Yusuf (2016) African philosophy of education: a powerful arrow in universities' bow. <https://theconversation.com/african-philosophy-of-education-a-powerful-arrow-in-universities-bow-62802>

Summary

The lives of persons with disabilities in the Global South have primarily been studied and intervened for from a Global North 'lens'. In most African countries with a colonial history, the provision of specialized education for learners with disabilities was initiated by charitable and religious organizations.

After the publication of the Salamanca Statement countries from the Global South started adopting inclusive education in contexts of 'underdevelopment' with 'colonial legacies'. Special, and later, inclusive education in the Global South was developed from a Global North education system, which provided quality basic education for all and was supported by technical, legislative, and financial resources to shift from special to inclusive education. Local, indigenous, and culturally relevant knowledge in educational were minimized.

In the literature review conducted, we provide information on the African Ubuntu concept in relation to inclusive education, providing readers with access to an initial list of documents submitted in an annotated bibliography and reading notes. Our review does not intent to be comprehensive but aims to identify the importance of cultural concepts of disability and inclusive education to counter and decolonize the dominant disability discourse on inclusive education imported from high income countries.

Our review describes how Ubuntu can be translated in practical interventions which make our schools and communities more inclusive. Although limited studies and literature are available on the practical implication and models of how Ubuntu can be implemented in or as inclusive education, we were able to derive the following themes: hospitality and belonging, shared responsibilities of family and community, supportive Ubuntu practices in the classroom, teaching Ubuntu, participation in policy and curricula reform.

More research is needed by various African scholars from different African countries to further develop and test interventions and evaluation methods based on the Ubuntu philosophy to create African inclusive education interventions.

Literature review

The concept of 'Ubuntu'

Ubuntu, translated to 'I am because we are' or 'humanity to others', has been embraced, and also carefully criticized as African humanism (Chataika & McKenzie, 2013; Hailey, 2008; Matolino & Kwindigwi, 2013; Mugumbate & Nyanguru, 2013). Mahayi (2018) described the development of the concept by the ancient Nguni philosophers and five sections of the Ubuntu philosophy: the creed, the body of traditions by which communities define themselves, customs, laws and other legal usages, constitutions, and the principles of Ubuntu, referring to Ngubane (1970, page 14).

Treating others with dignity and respect is a central element of the *Ubuntu* philosophy, as are the willingness to negotiate in good faith, the provision of opportunities for self-expression, understanding the beliefs and practices, honouring seniority, promoting equity, and being flexible and accommodative (Hailey, 2008). In *Ubuntu* social interrelations and responsibilities are a precondition for existence. The individual only has meaning in relationship to an experience of community (Msengana 2006: 20, in Chiwandire, 2020). *Ubuntu's* value of communalism '*promotes the cultivation of reciprocal relationships or friendships regardless of one's social status*' (Chiwandire, 2020, p.361). 'Strangers' in the Ubuntu philosophy need to be understood, embraced and protected, and be treated as part of an extended family (Chiwandire, 2020). In Zimbabwe Baba Jiri's work has inspired communities to use the concept of Ubuntu for inclusion. Jiri's model suggests to take persons you support as your friends or family, provide adequate care, education, housing, and support for all, through community initiatives (Mugumbate, 2020).

Whilst the word *Ubuntu* originally comes from South Africa, the same philosophy and concept of humanness is found in various East and South African countries, with each language having its own specific version and meaning of the concept (Hailey, 2008), e.g. *Obuntu bulamu* in Uganda (Bannink Mbazzi et al, 2020).

Disability definitions in sub-Saharan Africa

Impairment and disability definitions in the Global South are largely adopted through medical training, the ratification of the United Nations Convention of the Right of Persons with Disabilities (2006), subscription to the Sustainable Development Goals (United Nations, 2015), and language used in development aid projects (Bannink Mbazzi & Kawesa, 2022). These 'international' definitions, dominated by power and theories from the Global North, often do not value different understandings of disability and instead create generalized and simplified descriptions of disability experiences (Haang'andu 2018, Grech 2011, Meekosha 2011). In South Africa Howell et al (2019) showed how the dominance of disability constructs from the Global North reproduces the legacy of colonialism and associated patterns of inequality, and distorts the experiences of persons with disabilities in the Global South. It objectifies persons with disabilities, and reduces the disability

experience to the individual impairment, without taking into account the social, political and economic conditions responsible for the oppression and exclusion of disabled people (Howell, 2019).

Miles has argued to have ‘*people with a traditional heritage of concepts [...] delve into their folklore, art and drama, to uncover the positive and the ambivalent views of disability and assistance, and decide which are the authentic and valuable parts on which they will build*’ (Miles 2003b: 98). His argument is based on historical evidence that documents healing and other therapies, as well as self-organised groups and community practices with persons with disabilities in African countries (Miles, 2003).

Disability scholars have argued for valuing diverse understandings and a different discourse when studying disability in the Global South and have highlighted the importance of intersectionality of disability with race, gender, discrimination, post-colonialism, culture and poverty (Grech, 2009; Meekosha, 2011; Seligman & Darling, 2009; Whyte, 1995 ; Goodley, 2016). Chataika and McKenzie (2013) have suggested an intersectional approach with family, poverty, cultural conceptions of disability, and the notion of *ubuntu* (‘I am because we are’ or ‘humanity to others’) as central concepts when studying disability in sub-Saharan Africa (Chataika & McKenzie, 2013).

Ubuntu and disability

In 2007 the African Network for Evidence-to-Action (AfriNEAD) was established by a group of African researchers, practitioners, and disability activists to reclaim the identity and dignity of persons with disabilities. The network aims to establish a diverse ‘community of practice’ to provide evidence and ways of using this evidence to improve the lives of disabled people in Africa using the Ubuntu framework (Mji et al, 2011). The concept of Ubuntu impacts the way we treat others, and how our behaviour determines our position in a community (Chisale, 2020). It also considers the importance of interdependency and mutual responsibility in lives of persons with disabilities in Sub Saharan Africa (Bannink Mbazzi, 2020).

Chisale (2020) has described disability inclusion as a principle of Ubuntu. Berghs (2019) highlights how disability is seen as part of diversity rather difference in Ubuntu, and outlines how the view of disability as specialised individual medical issue was imported under (post)colonial influence. She explains how *Ubuntu* does not place individual blame on a child or mother, but instead questions why communities and governments fail in their compassionate responsibilities to respect and respond to human diversity.

“In an ubuntu model of disability, impairment becomes cognitive, sensory, mental, physical (inclusive of biological) and spiritual diversity that can have a multitude of shared meanings that society, as human collective, constantly (re) make together. Ubuntu can change over time and recognises difference of experiences of diversity of humanness (as positive or negative), which are part of our shared humanity” (Berghs, 2019, page 2).

In Ubuntu-oriented traditional societies, young people interacted with older people who oriented them on aspects of community laws and values, which includes disability inclusion (Chiwandire, 2020). Nicolaidis & Shozi (2021) describe how Ubuntu and respect and inclusion of persons with

disabilities is interrelated. Firstly, they state that if you act unkindly towards a person with a disability you automatically lose your Ubuntu. Secondly, individual autonomy is not a defining feature towards a person. Instead interdependency and communalism are defining in Ubuntu. Thirdly, the context of Ubuntu is communal and inclusive, minorities, including persons with disabilities, are part of this community, they cannot be seen as 'outsiders' or 'different' when practicing Ubuntu. Ubuntu's value of communalism promotes the cultivation of reciprocal relationships or friendships regardless of one's social status.

In Zimbabwe Mugumbate (2020) has described how Baba Jiri's Ubuntu approach in Zimbabwe has been translated in practical models of social care. He describes the HOPES model which stands for: having natural values of Ubuntu, observing the environment for opportunities to help; providing help using your own physical, financial and other resources ; encouraging and treating people you want to help as your friends and family; seeking outside help ; and starting and sustaining a charity. He further elaborates on the TO PARENT model for disability inclusion: to take people you want to help as your friends or family ; only use existing facilities like friends, hospitals and homes; provide resources like transport people to facilities because they may not be able to go on their own; adequate care, education and support; reducing stigma and cost of care; enterprises for income; need for supporting carers ; and training opportunities for self-reliance (Mugumbate, 2020).

Ubuntu and inclusive education

The lives of persons with disabilities in the Global South have primarily been studied and intervened for from a Global North 'lens' (Stubbs, 1999; Grech, 2009, 2011, 2014; Meekosha, 2011). In most African countries with a colonial history, the provision of specialized education for learners with disabilities was initiated by charitable and religious organizations (Chiwaya, 2021). After the publication of the Salamanca Statement countries from the Global South started adopting inclusive education in contexts of 'underdevelopment' with 'colonial legacies' (Walton, 2018). Special, and later, inclusive education in the Global South was developed from a Global North education system, which provided quality basic education for all and was supported by technical, legislative, and financial resources to shift from special to inclusive education. Local, indigenous, and culturally relevant knowledge in educational were minimized (Walton, 2018).

Walton (2018) calls the uncritical acceptance of diagnostic categories and inclusive education concepts from the Global North as coloniality of knowledge, and argues that instead of decolonizing inclusive education, we could look at inclusive education as a idea to resist coloniality (Walton, 2018). Various other authors have suggested to renovate African culture and rewrite education curricula and practices using indigenous knowledge (Biraimah, 2016; Oviawe, 2016; Mayahi, 2018). Kisanji (1998) and Phasha (2016) suggested that inclusive education is closely related to indigenous practices of Ubuntu and attitudes of people in sub-Saharan Africa and encouraged examining African history and cultural traditions. Mpofu (2007) explained how inclusive community practices including educational ones, are part of the Shona culture in Zimbabwe. Putting Ubuntu in education creates a consciousness of humanness (Mahaye, 2018):

“Education must create a consciousness among both children and adults that will encourage and enable them to think positively in the reclaiming and reconstruction of their history, cultural heritage, identity and personhood” (Mahayi, 2018, page 7).

This, Mahayi (2018) argues, could contribute to a new global agenda which challenges the domination of Eurocentric knowledge, often equated with ‘scientific knowledge’. Oviawe (2016) argues that the ubuntu paradigm in education can create educational systems that are culturally and intellectually relevant, and ameliorate the long standing effects of colonial legacy of the education system in Africa. Biraimah (2016) suggests a cultured and emancipatory pedagogy with inclusiveness, equity and equality as overarching objectives.

Oviawe (2016) suggests that Ubuntu can bridge the divide between the classroom and community and ‘foster a relationship that is reciprocal and symbiotic’ (page 9). Mahayi (2018) suggests to see schools as a community, not a collection of individuals. He argues that applying the core values of Ubuntu develops the humane character of students :

‘... applying the core values of Ubuntu such as humanness, caring, sharing, respect and compassion, develops the humane character of the students [...] Ubuntu in education makes learners to acknowledge humanity in themselves and others’ (Mahayi, 2018, page 17/18).

When Ubuntu is part of education, it reflects discipline, community-school partnerships, respect, and care for all learners and teachers irrespective of their background or circumstances (Mahayi, 2018).

The ‘revival’ of Ubuntu has been encouraged and taken up by especially South African leaders, but also been criticized as utopian by Matolino and Kwindigwi (2013), questioning its relevance in a modern and differentiated society such as South Africa. Without neglecting the concerns, Walton (2018) describes the potential of ‘*an Afrocentric conceptualisation of inclusive education based [...] in the African philosophy of Ubuntu, which emphasis humanness, interdependence, and communalism*’. She emphasizes how inclusive education can identify and address exclusion beyond disability (e.g. race, poverty, gender), and considers ‘*the intersectionality of identities of children and how this impacts learning*’ (Walton, 2018).

Practical implications of Ubuntu inspired inclusive education

Limited studies and literature are available on the practical implication and models of how Ubuntu can be implemented in or as inclusive education. From the available literature the following themes were derived: hospitality and belonging, shared responsibilities of family and community, supportive Ubuntu practices in the classroom, teaching Ubuntu, participation in policy and curricula reform.

An attitude of hospitality and belonging

Chiwandire (2021) described how *Ubuntu* calls on us to see our obligations to one another more holistically and incorporate the “whole person”. He described hospitability as part of Ubuntu values: inclusion is not only about physical access, and learning methods, but about the *attitude* of welcoming the stranger, making sure that they feel at home and have their needs accommodated

and catered for. These needs, Chiwandire (2021) lists as food, shelter, health care, education and social life. Chiwandire (2021) describes how hospitality will eventually improve physical access, as one would want to include all members of the community in sports, and make sure they access buildings in which the community learns, lives, and celebrates. Similarly Bannink-Mbazzi et al. (2020) in Uganda emphasized the importance of creating peer to peer support networks to create a sense of belonging, which in turn facilitates inclusive education in the classroom, at home, and the wider school community. Chiwaya too stresses the need for belonging and says “We need to take these children as our own” (page 136).

Shared responsibility: family and community involvement

‘The concept of inclusive education which once upon a time was embedded within the African extended family values and norms now appears to be a foreign concept imported from western countries (Muzata, 2021, page 24).

To reclaim indigenous practices and values and implement Ubuntu inspired inclusive education, family and community involvement is key (Bannink Mbazzi, 2020 ; Chiwandire, 2021 ; Masendo 2017 ; Masengi, 2021).

Masendo (2017) described a case study in which principals in South Africa form a support team, which includes community members, parents, and local leaders to draw on the Ubuntu approach to implement inclusive education. Through the different actors awareness raising and support is organized to improve inclusion in the school and community at large.

Ubuntu inspired inclusive education in Uganda has been described by Bannink Mbazzi et al (2020) as ‘shared responsibility’. Bannink Mbazzi et al (2020) promote the Ubuntu value of communal responsibility in an inclusive education intervention in Uganda, titled ‘Obuntu bulamu’, involving children, parents and teachers. Trainings in Ubuntu combined with peer to peer support activities in communities have shown potential to improve inclusion of children with disabilities in education. The peer to peer support activities were developed by and are implemented by children, parents and teachers themselves. Each child, parent, and teacher is matched with a ‘peer’ and engage in a reciprocal supportive relationship. Alongside the peer pair support, regular encounters take place with the respective child, parent and teacher and their peer to create a community of support.

Muzata (2021) argues that the extended family should be included to ensure inclusive education is successful. He suggests a mixed method approach in which current inclusive education methods such as the development of an individual education plan, includes relatives (not only parents), emphasizes home education on disability for the family and communities, and builds on traditional learning methods and roles within the family (e.g. grandparents as counsellors).

In Uganda Ejuu and Opiyo (2022) developed the IHELP model for inclusive home-based early childhood education in Uganda. This model adopts the 5 layers from the European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education but contextualizes the layers to the outcome. In the first layer (the child) social responsibility, moral and spiritual values, participation in activities, use of knowledge,

and language, and respect for self and others are key. In the second layer the relationship between the child and peers (siblings, parents) is central. This introduces the child to norms, language, socialisation and life skills, and discipline. The third layer the teachers mentor and instruct, and introduce the child to horizons beyond the local community. The fourth layer is the community in which the child learns to differentiate and act according to their context, these include larger societal goals and aspirations. The fifth layer is the human flourishing, the reason why we do all that we do, in the hope our children with flourish and exhibit Ubuntu. Within a IHELP project in Kenya, Uganda, Zimbabwe 24 home-based care units were started and managed by families of the same community. Parents enroll their children in the centre, contribute by conducting lessons, preparing meals, and maintaining the centre. They teach children cultural values, play and language activities, and include children with disabilities. The model is designed to ensure a community response to child care, and provide education and cultural enrichment true to the Ubuntu culture (Ejuu & Opiyoo, 2022).

Supportive Ubuntu inspired practices in the classroom

Alongside the teaching about Ubuntu, some of the children's peer support activities in the Ugandan Ubuntu intervention include practical classroom support such as ensuring a child using a wheelchair has a peer for mobility support, children with difficulties in information processing, hearing or handwriting having peer note takers, and parents and teachers bringing local materials to school to make sports activities and learning materials inclusive (Bannink Mbazzi, 2020). Chiwandire (2021) too mentioned that volunteering to take notes in class, can be an expression of Ubuntu.

Shanyanana & Waghid (2016) have argued for an Ubuntu of inclusion as voice, to ensure equilization of voice in the classroom. She suggests that all students, including those excluded, should be encouraged to air their views, whilst others are expected to listen. She argues to support marginalized groups to develop confidence and ability to air their views and participate like others.

Lorenzo (2003) recommended to use storytelling to build emotional resourcefulness, nurturing families and children in disability issues and renewing spirituality and Ubuntu in disability development with a focus on interdependence. Through the stories children and adults learn more about Ubuntu values and practices and display behaviour which is supportive of one another. An important addition here is the focus on interdependence rather than independence, often overly emphasized in imported models of inclusive education and contradicting Ubuntu values.

Differentiated learning too, if taking place in a conventional (imported) inclusive classroom approach, does not automatically result in friendships (Chiwandire, 2020). By using an Ubuntu inclusive education approach, emphasis is put on creating social networks and extra-curricular activities, Chiwandire calls this a shift from 'academic' to 'social' inclusion to achieve inclusive education (Chiwandire, 2020). Masengi (2021) too has emphasised the importance on the social aspects of learning and activities outside the classroom and suggests dedicated activities and time to foster this.

Teaching Ubuntu

Odari (2020) has emphasized the importance of educators as agents of change and has argued that 'Ubuntu' as a philosophy should be compulsory in teachers' education to build a more humanistic and inclusive society. As students spend the majority of their time with their teachers, the teachers, Odari argues, need to be able to actualise the principles of Ubuntu as 'agents of change' (p.65). Collins-Warfield (2008) described how teachers do not just need to know about Ubuntu, but have to live it, which creates a nurturing school environment in which all members receive attention and care. In Chiwaya's study in Malawi (2021), teachers themselves expressed the importance of Ubuntu in teaching: *'If a teacher lacks umunthu, love, and care, it does not work'* (page 136). This is in line with Chiwandire (2021) statement : *'when Ubuntu ceases to exist, the implementation of inclusive education will fail'* (p.36).

In her in-depth research in South Africa Collins-Warfield (2008) show how Ubuntu is a key element of the Xhosa teacher community. She described how teachers feel the responsibility to teach about Ubuntu, because of its erosion due to globalization. They teach students about ubuntu by modelling it in everyday actions and behaviour. She described teacher-student support as well as teacher-teacher support in terms of food, clothing, social and moral support. To be part of a school community it is important to show care, kindness, and support towards each other. A community in her participants' descriptions show caring and kindness to each other, offer help and support to one another, and cooperate to resolve disagreements (Collins-Warfield, 2008):

By reaching out to students, not only do teachers fulfill the children's needs, but the teachers also fulfill their own need to feel useful and their need to feel as though they are living out the ubuntu philosophy (Collins-Warfield, 2008, page 76).

The Ubuntu bulamu disability inclusion intervention in Uganda (Bannink-Mbazzi et al, 2020) emphasizes the need to include Ubuntu as a philosophy in teachers training, but also see education as a community which needs to include family members and neighbours. Hence teachers training should not only include teaching on Ubuntu by other teachers, but also involve family and community members to inform and co-facilitate training.

Participation in policy reform

Ohajunwa (2022) reviewed inclusive education policies in South Africa, Ghana, and Uganda and found that local knowledge is insufficiently included in national policies. He argues to promote and treat local knowledge as a community resource for policy implementation. In the three countries, he described a knowledge gap from implementation of inclusive education policies to the education of children with disabilities. Popularisation of inclusive education policies are in his description often 'information sessions', rather than sharing sessions in which local knowledge can be discussed and local communities can contribute. Ohajunwa (2012) suggests community engagement from the policy formation through implementation.

Chiwaya (2021) argues for involvement of teachers in developing and implementing inclusive education policy to ensure indigenous values are considered. Similarly, Bannink-Mbazzi & Kawesa (2022) have argued the voice of children and parents needs to be included to ensure policy and curricula reforms are relevant to the cultural context and daily reality of children with disabilities in sub-Saharan Africa.

Lephoto (2021) described how in Lesotho Ubuntu principles of participation, solidarity, interdependence and connectedness can provide valuable inputs to facilitate inclusive education. Lephoto gives an example of having teacher counsellors work collaboratively and in solidarity with school administrations, parents and learners to develop necessary inclusive education policies and practices. He argues for operationalization of Ubuntu principles to (re)construct knowledge and learning. In line with this Chiwandire (2021) describes Ubuntu values as a *'a useful platform for re-evaluating social relationships and institutional practices [...]'* (p.313).

Curriculum reform

Mutanga (2022) suggested curriculum reform to follow principles of Ubuntu and guide curriculum design, its content, and evaluation of inclusive education: *"Ubuntu philosophy can help us reimagine and attend to inclusive education in a much more appropriate manner by also attending to what is taught instead of only focusing on location and the how part of teaching and learning."* (page 17). Mutanga (2022) has argued that inclusive education from an Ubuntu perspective is broader than imported inclusive education. He described the lack of inclusive education as a 'lack of care', which 'undermines teachers' ability to get educated and educate students' (page 14). He narrates how the curriculum, pedagogy, and physical location and preparedness of teachers are key in determining inclusive education.

Mahayi (2018) described a multicultural curriculum needs to be 'well-conceived, sensitive, thorough, and include the histories, experiences, traditions, and cultures of students in the classroom' (page 22). He argues to discover methods of comprehension with the students to teach multiculturalism and discover learning styles and strengths. He argues that culturally responsive classrooms can include writing assignments, but should also look outside the classroom. Odari (2020) and Walton (2018) have suggested to include African textbooks in the curriculum. Mahayi (2018) also suggested to include family members in assignments and weave family stories and traditions into teaching. A similar approach was used by the Ubuntu bulamu study team (Bannink Mbazzi et al, 2020) in Uganda. They also argue to expand learning beyond the classroom, something Odari (2020) also suggested by encouraging homestay activities and community services.

In addition Odari (2020) suggests to change exam-driven curricula to person-driven curricula, in which character building and core values such as empathy, respect, compassion, and justice are educational goals. He proposes a education curricula that *'focus on nurturing students and teachers with uphold compassion, wisdom and the courage to embrace others and their differences'* (page 65).

The (university) classroom, Shanyanana (2016) suggests, should not only socialize students with knowledge constructs but should also facilitate critical questioning of what has been taught. This can help reform curricula and make them more inclusive.

Conclusion

Many traditional ways of caring for persons with disabilities in communities were destroyed when colonial humanitarian models were introduced (Ingstad 1999, Miles 2003). In our review we explored the opportunities the 'Ubuntu' philosophy offers in relation to inclusive education.

Ubuntu can be translated in practical interventions which make our schools and communities more inclusive. More research is needed by various African scholars from different African countries to further develop and test interventions and evaluation methods based on the Ubuntu philosophy to create African inclusive education interventions.

Key points

1. Inclusive education interventions from the Global North are often based on a human rights approach which focuses on individual development and independence. This approach can emphasize 'difference' and 'inability', and often contradicts the value of community and interdependence, which are key in many African societies.
2. International organizations and bodies need to question how 'international' their guidelines and programs are and make a deliberate effort to support decolonization of inclusive education in African countries.
3. Inclusive education interventions should be based on the countries' history, traditional and current education systems, and cultural concepts of disability and Ubuntu to achieve inclusion of students with disabilities.
4. Ubuntu inspired inclusive education interventions:
 - a. promote hospitality and peer support between students, parents, teachers, and communities to establish a sense of belonging beyond the classroom
 - b. foster shared responsibility and emphasize social inclusion
 - c. train teachers in the Ubuntu philosophy and way of working with children, youth, and parents
 - d. consider participatory curriculum development which goes beyond the school and includes students, families and communities
 - e. support policy reform which involves children, parents and teachers, considering history and culture and challenge coloniality of knowledge.
5. More research on the development and use of indigenous knowledge and inclusive practices based on the Ubuntu philosophy is needed.

Reading notes

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | 'Obuntu Bulamu'–Development and Testing of an Indigenous Intervention for Disability Inclusion in Uganda. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.sjdr.se/articles/10.16993/sjdr.697/ |
| Author | Bannink Mbazzi, Femke |
| References | Bannink Mbazzi, F., Nalugya, R., Kawesa, E., Nambejja, H., Nizeyimana, P., Ojok, P., ... & Seeley, J. (2020). 'Obuntu Bulamu'–Development and Testing of an Indigenous Intervention for Disability Inclusion in Uganda. <i>Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research</i> , 22(1), 403-416. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Femke Bannink Mbazzi is an Assistant Professor at the MRC/UVRI & LSHTM Uganda Research Unit |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: this paper describe how an inclusive education intervention was designed using the Ubuntu philosophy in Uganda</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: the intervention was only piloted in Uganda so far.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 406-410 description of the intervention development, testing and evaluation.</p> |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Practices and discourses of ubuntu: Implications for an African model of disability? |
| Link to the publication | https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5502472/pdf/AJOD-6-292.pdf |

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Author | Berghs, Maria. Affiliation: independent. |
| References | Berghs, M. (2017). Practices and discourses of ubuntu: Implications for an African model of disability? <i>African Journal of Disability</i> , 6(1), 1-8. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • UN convention • Social perception / awareness • Social protection • International development • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Maria Berghs is a social and cultural anthropologist with a PhD in Sociology and Social Policy at Monfort University. Her research interests, writing and teaching include; social justice, ethics, impairment, disability, new genetics and technologies, commodification of care, medical humanitarianism, conflict, destabilisation, and global public health in Africa, specifically Sierra Leone. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: This article gives a good overview of the concept of Ubuntu and potential it has for disability inclusion, it described the ways Ubuntu influenced and is part of disability activism in South and West Africa: <i>“In an ubuntu model of disability, impairment becomes cognitive, sensory, mental, physical (inclusive of biological) and spiritual diversity that can have a multitude of shared meanings that society, as human collective, constantly (re) make together. Ubuntu can change over time and recognises difference of experiences of diversity of humanness (as positive or negative), which are part of our shared humanity”</i> (Berghs, page 2). Berghs also explains the strength of Ubuntu in disability inclusion: <i>“Ubuntu does not place individual blame on a child, nor mother, but asks why a community, institution or state is failing in its compassionate responsibilities towards upholding respect for human diversity, who is filling the gap and why and what can be done to change such discourses and practices.”</i> (Berghs, page 6). Berghs highlights how disability is seen as part of diversity rather difference in Ubuntu, and outlines how the view of disability as specialised individual medical issue was imported under (post)colonial influence. She emphasizes the importance of African history and narratives of disability.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: gives some but limited examples of how this can be translated into practice.</p> |

| | |
|--|--|
| | Specific pages of interest: Section <i>Ubuntu</i> : Implications for understanding disability page 2 and discussion section: page 6-7. |
|--|--|

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Moving beyond a destructive past to a decolonised and inclusive future: The role of ubuntu-style education in providing culturally relevant pedagogy for Namibia. |
| Link to the publication | https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11159-016-9541-1 |
| Author | Biraimah, Karen Affiliation: University of Central Florida. |
| References | Biraimah, K. L. (2016). Moving beyond a destructive past to a decolonised and inclusive future: The role of ubuntu-style education in providing culturally relevant pedagogy for Namibia. <i>International Review of Education</i> , 62(1), 45-62. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • International development • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Karen Biraimah is a Professor of Comparative and International Education at the University of Central Florida. Her expertise are social foundations of education, intersectionality of race, class, and gender, and international education. She has conducted research and was affiliated to universities in Kenya and Namibia. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: This article describes the intersectionality of poverty, race, disability, and gender in postcolonial Namibia, and the application of an Ubuntu-style pedagogy in the classroom. Biraimah suggests 6 areas in which Ubuntu can be utilized: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Culturally responsive caring in the classroom • Early childhood education • Inclusion of mother-tongue instruction • Culturally diverse curriculum content • Inclusion of learners with disabilities • Effective studying for learners in poverty |

| | |
|--|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the section on inclusion of learners with disabilities he argues to reflect on Ubuntu pedagogy, stepping away from the cost and application approaches often tabled when discussing challenges and limitations in inclusive education. <p>Limitation of the resource: mostly refers to UN documents and inclusive education standards as set by the Global North, gives little detail of what the Ubuntu-pedagogy is and how it can practically be used with learners with disabilities.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: Section inclusion of learners with disabilities, page 57/58.</p> |
|--|---|

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / PhD thesis |
| Title | “Munhu wese ihama yako (everyone is your relative)”: Ubuntu and the social inclusion of students with disabilities at South African universities. |
| Link to the publication | http://hdl.handle.net/10962/170578 |
| Author | Chiwandire, Affiliation: Rhodes University, South Africa |
| References | Chiwandire. 2021. “Munhu wese ihama yako (everyone is your relative)”: Ubuntu and the social inclusion of students with disabilities at South African universities. Master thesis, 484 pages. Rhodes University. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • International development • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Desire Chiwandire (Des) is a South African-based ‘early career’ Critical Disability Studies researcher currently working as a Postdoctoral Fellow in the Chair for Critical Studies in Higher Education Transformation (CriSHET) at Nelson Mandela University (NMU). He holds a PhD in Political and International Studies from Rhodes University where he also taught undergraduate and postgraduate courses in Critical Disability Studies and Political Studies for four years. His doctoral thesis focused on the social inclusion of students with disabilities at South African universities. |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>Commentary (maximum one page)</p> | <p>Reason for selection: This dissertation describes the importance of moving from an academic to a 'social' inclusion of students with disabilities, and shift needed from a Western human rights approach to an Ubuntu approach to higher education. He explains how the right to education approach promotes self-sufficiency, individual achievement, and competitiveness, which casts persons with disabilities as 'lacking'. Inclusion focused on classroom settings only can isolate the student. Social inclusion requires a sense of belonging. Chiwandire argues that social inclusion can be promoted through residences, extra-curricular activities, sports, and other activities which are not academic but create friendships and inclusion with students from different backgrounds. This in turn can then positively affect the academic process, as peer support can be offered in academic, as well as social situations. He argues for interventions which create a sense of belonging and emphasizes the importance of facilitating the creation of friendships amongst students with and without disabilities.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: length of text (it is a dissertation).</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: Full thesis. For short summary / recommendations: conclusion (page 360- 385).</p> |
|--|---|

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Ubuntu in inclusive education: a Malawian experience. <i>inclusivity in response to diversity and equal human rights</i> . |
| Link to the publication | http://hdl.handle.net/10962/170578 |
| Author | Chiwaya, S., Dreyer, L. & Damons, L. |
| References | Chiwaya, S., Dreyer, L., & Damons, L. (2020) Ubuntu in inclusive education: a malawian experience. <i>inclusivity in response to diversity and equal human rights</i> . Abstract conference paper. Page 130 – 132. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • International development • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Author resumé | Chiwaya Stanley is a lecturer at Lilongwe University of Agriculture and Natural Resources. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: This is an excellent example from Malawi on how indigenous practices are key to inclusive education, and how the inclusion of teachers in the development of inclusive education policy and practice is pertinent. Limitation of the resource: It is a conference abstract, examples are rich but limited in number. Specific pages of interest: discussion and conclusion (page 135-136). |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / PhD thesis |
| Title | “Ubuntu”–Philosophy and Practice: An Examination of Xhosa Teachers’ Psychological Sense of Community in Langa, South Africa |
| Link to the publication | https://etd.ohiolink.edu/apexprod/rws_olink/r/1501/10?clear=10&p10_accession_num=bgsu1225405676 |
| Author | Collins, Warfield, A. E. |
| References | Collins-Warfield, A. E. (2008). “Ubuntu”–Philosophy and Practice: An Examination of Xhosa Teachers’ Psychological Sense of Community in Langa, South Africa (Doctoral dissertation, Bowling Green State University). |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Amy Collins-Warfield is a postdoc researcher at Ohio University |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: This thesis explores teachers’ professional working relationships (i.e., the teacher community) at Sandile Primary School in Langa, South Africa. This study focused on the intersections of the teachers’ psychological sense of community and their interpretations of the indigenous philosophy of ubuntu. |

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p>Limitation of the resource: long text / PhD thesis</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: discussion of findings 93-97.</p> |
|--|--|

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | Nurturing Ubuntu, the African Form of Human Flourishing through Inclusive Home Based Early Childhood Education. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.838770/full |
| Author | Ejuu, Godfrey & Rose Athieno Opiyo, Affiliations: Kyambogo University (Uganda), Masinde Muliro University of Science and Technology (Kenya) |
| References | Ejuu, G., & Opiyo, R. A. (2022) Nurturing Ubuntu, the African Form of Human Flourishing through Inclusive Home Based Early Childhood Education. In <i>Frontiers in Education</i> , 7 (1), 1-5. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Godfrey Ejuu is a lecturer and head of Early Childhood Education at the Faculty of Education at Kyambogo University |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: This is an interesting example of how Ubuntu is used to develop and implement an inclusive community based early childhood education model in Uganda, Kenya and Zimbabwe, using an African theoretical framework.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: it explains children with disabilities are included 1 day a week and may later on join the program it is unclear if the same regulations are imposed on children without disabilities.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: models and conclusion (page 2-5).</p> |

| | |
|------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Reimagining personal and collective experiences of disability in Africa. |

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Link to the publication | https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10077477/1/06_02_02.pdf |
| Author | Howell, C., Lorenzo, T., & Sompeta-Gcaza, S. |
| References | Howell, C., Lorenzo, T., & Sompeta-Gcaza, S. (2019). Reimagining personal and collective experiences of disability in Africa. <i>Disability and the Global South</i> , 6(2), 1719-1735. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • International development • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Colleen Howell is Lecturer in Education and International Development at University College London. She implemented this research in collaboration with Theresa Lorenzo and Siphokazi Sompeta-Gcaza and students from the University of Cape Town, South Africa. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: this article described the disability experiences of university students with disabilities in South Africa. Limitation of the resource: limited to higher education. Specific pages of interest: 1722-1731 findings and conclusion. |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Application of Ubuntu Philosophy for the enhancement of Guidance and Counselling: An alternative for facilitating Inclusive Education in Lesotho. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.ul.ac.za/aportal/application/downloads/Article_5_12_2021.pdf |
| Author | Lephoto, M. N. R. |
| References | Lephoto, M. N. R. (2021). Application of Ubuntu Philosophy for the enhancement of Guidance and Counselling: An alternative for facilitating Inclusive Education in Lesotho. <i>African Perspectives of Research in Teaching and Learning</i> , 5, 95-107. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education |

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Malephoto Niko Ruth Lephoto is a lecturer at the National University of Lesotho, Lesotho. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: this article describes how Basotho philosophical statements of justice, equality, peace, participatory democracy and co-existence informs inclusive education policy in Malawi.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: limited practical suggestion on how the Ubuntu principles can be translated into practice.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: page 103 – 104.</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | No African renaissance without disabled women: a communal approach to human development in Cape Town South Africa. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/0968759032000119505?casa_token=EXYmAbl2euUAAAAA:c5AVeudqibNkiOXI5dcvYbC76KkFU5Oge8l0qMp6s43NqO5OJBQwdvHXLpvKi2240Ce5lOrU5ntp |
| Author | Lorenzo, T. |
| References | Lorenzo, T., 2003. No African renaissance without disabled women: a communal approach to human development in Cape Town South Africa. <i>Disability & Society</i> , 18 (6), 759–778. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • International development • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Author resumé | Theresa Lorenzo is a Professor at the University of Cape Town, Health Sciences, Occupational Therapy. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: this article has very powerful explanation on the African renaissance and complexities of disability interventions in Africa. Lorenzo highlights the following themes which are applicable to inclusive education programs. She suggests to use story telling to build emotional resourcefulness, nurturing families and children in disability issues and renewing spirituality and Ubuntu in disability development with a focus on interdependence. Limitation of the resource: not directly written on inclusive education Specific pages of interest: 772 – 774 |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / PhD thesis |
| Title | Enhancing the effectiveness of principals in implementing inclusive education using Ubuntu approach |
| Link to the publication | https://scholar.ufs.ac.za/bitstream/handle/11660/7653/MasondoNC.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y |
| Author | Masondo, C. N. |
| References | Masondo, C. N. (2017). <i>Enhancing the effectiveness of principals in implementing inclusive education using Ubuntu approach</i> . Doctoral dissertation, University of the Free State. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Charity Masondo is a student at the University of Free State, South Africa. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: This study describes a framework to enhance the effectiveness of principals in implementing inclusive education, using the Ubuntu approach. Recommended strategies include: development of a support team, involvement of parents and community and awareness raising and training. |

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p>Limitation of the resource: long text / PhD thesis.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 141 – 145 findings and conclusions</p> |
|--|--|

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | An African way of networking around disability |
| Link to the publication | https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09687599.2011.560419 |
| Author | Mji, G., Gcaza, S., Swartz, L., MacLachlan, M., & Hutton, B. |
| References | <p>Mji, G., Gcaza, S., Swartz, L., MacLachlan, M., & Hutton, B. (2011). An African way of networking around disability. <i>Disability & Society</i>, 26(3), 365-368.</p> <p>https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09687599.2011.560419</p> |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | <p>Gubela Mji is the director of the Centre for Rehabilitation Studies at Stellenbosch University, which aims to improve the quality of life and level of community integration of persons with disabilities. She is engaged in various collaborative disability research projects and networks at both African and international levels for realization of the rights of people with disabilities. Some of her work involves issues of development of models of best practice for rehabilitation, transformation, development and indigenous knowledge systems.</p> |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: This article describes the establishment and importance of the African Network for Evidence-to-Action (AfriNEAD), which aims to establish a diverse 'community of practice' to provide evidence and ways of using this evidence to improve the lives of disabled people in Africa using the Ubuntu framework.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: not specifically focused on education.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 367 research methodologies</p> |

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | Baba Jairos Jiri's ubuntu models of charity, disability and rehabilitation |
| Link to the publication | https://www.ajol.info/index.php/ajsw/article/view/194112 |
| Author | Mugumbate, Jacob |
| References | Mugumbate, J. (2020).. <i>African Journal of Social Work</i> , 10(1), 83-88. https://www.ajol.info/index.php/ajsw/article/view/194112 |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Jacob Mugumbate is a PhD scholar at Bindura University of Science Education (Zimbabwe) and the University of New Castle. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: This article gives a short but elaborate history of Baba Jiri, explain the models that characterize baba Jiri's work and reframe these models using ubuntu theory. It also points out how these models could be used by academics, researchers, learners, practitioners and activists.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: only a small part is focused</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 87.</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | Perceptions and experiences of teachers in Zimbabwe on inclusive education and teacher training: the value of Unhu/Ubuntu philosophy. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2022.2048102 |
| Author | Mutanga, O. |
| References | Mutanga, O. (2022). Perceptions and experiences of teachers in Zimbabwe on inclusive education and teacher training: the value of Unhu/Ubuntu philosophy. <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> , 1-20. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Oliver Mutanga is an independent scholar from Zimbabwe. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: This paper describes how inclusive education automatically takes place when Ubuntu is practiced. It gives an overview of teachers ideas and practice of inclusive education in Zimbabwe.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: is missing curriculum content suggestions based on Ubuntu.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 11 -17.</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | The Extended Family System as a Model of Africanizing Inclusive Education Through Ubuntu |
| Link to the publication | https://www.igi-global.com/chapter/the-extended-family-system-as-a-model-of-africanizing-inclusive-education-through-ubuntu/276719 |
| Author | Muzata, K. K., Mahlo, D., & Simui, F. |
| References | Muzata, K. K., Mahlo, D., & Simui, F. (2021). The Extended Family System as a Model of Africanizing Inclusive Education Through Ubuntu. In <i>Understanding Ubuntu for Enhancing Intercultural Communications</i> (pp. 13-27). IGI Global. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Author resumé | Kenneth Kapalu Muzata is a lecturer and researcher in the Department of Educational Psychology, Sociology and Special Education (EPSSE) at the University of Zambia, School of Education. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: this article emphasizes the importance of involvement of the extended family in the education of children (with disabilities) in Zambia and South Africa. The authors explains how different family members contribute to the teaching and care of children, e.g. grandparents may provide counselling function, and need to be included in school. They discuss the importance of IEP meetings with parents, and also discuss the possibilities of home education in addition to inclusive education at school.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: no alternatives for urban areas where family structures have changed.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 18-24.</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | The philosophy of Ubuntu in education. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.researchgate.net/publication/336995193 |
| Author | Mayahe, N.E. |
| References | Mahaye, N. E. (2018, January 18). The philosophy of ubuntu in education. Unpublished work. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • International development • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Mayahe Ngogi Emmanuel is the director of the Department of Education of KwaZulu-Natal. Mahaye has an interest in research in Educational Policy, Educational Management, and Educational Leadership. |

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: this paper describes how Ubuntu can be used to make education inclusive, and give practical examples on how best this is done. Limitation of the resource: this paper was not peer-reviewed. Specific pages of interest: 20 – 24. |
|----------------------------------|---|

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | The role of value creating education and Ubuntu philosophy in fostering humanism in Kenya |
| Link to the publication | https://www.ojed.org/index.php/jise/article/view/1857 |
| Author | |
| References | Odari, M. H. (2020). The role of value creating education and Ubuntu philosophy in fostering humanism in Kenya. <i>Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies in Education</i> , 9, 56, 68. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Masumi Odari is the chair of the Literature Department at Nairobi University. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | Reason for selection: this article emphasizes the importance of educators as agents of change, explains how the Ubuntu philosophy should be mandatory in training to eventually build a more humanistic and inclusive society. Practical suggestions include moving beyond classroom learning by encouraging homestay activities and community services, as well as inclusion of African textbooks in the curriculum. Odari also suggests to change exam-driven curricula to person-driven curricula, in which character building and core values such as empathy, respect, compassion, and justice are educational goals. |

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p>Limitation of the resource: the article describes 2 philosophies which makes it a bit confusing for the reader.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 63 – 65.</p> |
|--|--|

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research / project |
| Title | Local knowledge in inclusive education policies in Africa: informing sustainable outcomes |
| Link to the publication | https://ajod.org/index.php/ajod/article/view/941/1705 |
| Author | Ohajunwa, Chioma O. |
| References | Ohajunwa, Chioma O. "Local knowledge in inclusive education policies in Africa: informing sustainable outcomes." <i>African journal of disability</i> vol. 11 941. 31 Jan. 2022, doi:10.4102/ajod.v11i0.941. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Chioma Ohajumwa is a lecturer at Stellenbosch University. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: in this research participants across South Africa, Ghana and Uganda reiterate the relevance of local knowledge for informing sustainable policy outcomes that cater to local realities. The author argues for community involvement throughout the process of policy formation and implementation.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: mostly focuses on policy formation.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 4-7.</p> |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | How to rediscover the ubuntu paradigm in education. |
| Link to the publication | https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11159-016-9545-x |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Author | Oviawe, J.O. |
| References | Oviawe, J. O. (2016). How to rediscover the ubuntu paradigm in education. <i>International Review of Education</i> , 62, 1-10. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Community • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Joan Osariemen Oviawe is a Nigerian scholar and lecturer at Washington State University. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: this paper describes a special issue that was published on the use of Ubuntu in education in Africa.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: it mostly summarises the 4 papers in the special issue.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 6-9</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Confronting inclusive education in Africa since Salamanca. <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> , 23(7-8), 782-795. |
| Link to the publication | https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13603116.2019.1623329 |
| Author | Pather, S. |
| References | Pather, S. (2019). Confronting inclusive education in Africa since Salamanca. <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> , 23(7-8), 782-795. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Family • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Sulochini Pather is a Professor of Education at Leeds Trinity University. Her research expertise lies in Inclusive education and the inclusion and exclusion of marginalised groups of learners, including children with disabilities and special needs, from minority ethnic groups and migrant communities. Sulochini has been a teacher in South Africa and England, a Professor of Inclusive Education at Nazarbayev University in Kazakhstan, and Lecturer at several universities in the UK. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection: discuss the tension of the interpretation of inclusive education and implementation of the Salamanca statement in African countries.</p> <p>Limitation of the resource: discusses Ubuntu as an alternative discourse but does not provide practical examples. Not open access.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 789 - 790</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Research |
| Title | Reconceptualizing ubuntu as inclusion in African higher education: Towards equalization of voice. |
| Link to the publication | https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/188225091.pdf |
| Author | Rachel Ndinelao Shanyanana and Yusef Waghid |
| References | Shanyanana, R. N., & Waghid, Y. (2016). Reconceptualizing ubuntu as inclusion in African higher education: Towards equalization of voice. <i>Knowledge Cultures</i> 4(4), 104–120. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Rachel Ndinelao Shanyanana is a lecturer in the Education department at the University of Namibia. Yusef Waghid is distinguished professor of philosophy of education at Stellenbosch University in South Africa. He is the author of <i>Towards a philosophy of caring in higher education: pedagogy and nuances of care</i> . |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Proposes to re-examine the potentiality of an African philosophy of Ubuntu as a way of curtailing exclusionary practices in higher education - Argues for “equalization of voice” and an Ubuntu of inclusion as voice - Encourages to think differently about African people’s communal practices, thus looking differently at their conception of a knowledge culture. <p>Limitation of the resource: main focus is on gender exclusion and theory.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 118.</p> |

| | |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Type of resource | Journal article |
| Title | Decolonising (through) inclusive education? |
| Link to the publication | http://www.scielo.org.za/pdf/ersc/v7nspe/04.pdf |
| Author | Elizabeth Walton |
| References | Walton, E. (2018). Decolonising (through) inclusive education? <i>Educational research for social change</i> , 7(SPE), 31-45. |
| Research field (where appropriate) | Humanities and social sciences |
| Topics | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education • Social perception / awareness • Social protection • Decolonization (suggested as new category) |
| Disabilities | All |
| Geographical areas | Africa |
| Funding | N/A |
| Author resumé | Elizabeth Walton is an Associate Professor in the School of Education at the University of Nottingham, UK. She is a member of the forum of the UNESCO Chair for Teacher Education for Diversity and Development and a visiting Associate Professor at the Wits School of Education in Johannesburg, South Africa. |
| Commentary (maximum one page) | <p>Reason for selection:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gives an excellent overview of the history of inclusive education and challenges of its implementation in South Africa - Critical reflection on the potential and limitations of Ubuntu for inclusive education <p>Limitation of the resource: some but limited practical solutions.</p> <p>Specific pages of interest: 39-41</p> |